



Climate Change Advisory Council Meeting –Carbon Budgets Working Group

Meeting 2

APPROVED MINUTES

Date: 20th April 2023

Start time: 13:30

Venue: Video Conference Meeting

Present: In person: Hannah Daly, James Murphy, Brian Ó' Gallachóir, Emma Lynch, Trevor Donnellan, Kevin Hanrahan

On MS Teams: David Styles, Yvonne Buckley, Niall McInerney, Jeanne Moore, Niamh Garvey, Kian Mintz-Woo, Mert Yakut.

Apologies: Stephen Treacy Colm Duffy, Kelly de Bruin, Jim Scheer

Agenda Item 5: Fergal Egan, ESB Networks joined for this item.

Observers: John Fitzgerald, Jillian Mahon

Secretariat: George Hussey, Meabh Gallagher, Gina Kelly, Simon Ngorok, Phillip O'Brien, Kieran Craven, Ciara Hilliard

1. Opening of meeting

1.1. Adoption of Agenda

The agenda was adopted by the Committee.

1.2. Minutes for the Committee on Carbon Budget Meeting

Minutes were adopted and the actions log was discussed. Both actions raised at the previous meeting have been completed.

The updated Terms of Reference were discussed and are due to be published on the CCAC website once the website is updated. It was noted that as the website is currently undergoing a broader update, in July an updated section will be available on the website covering the CB WG. It was also noted that an international member of the group is still being sought.

2. Carbon Budgets Methodology

The Secretariat addressed the main issues addressed further to the feedback received after the last meeting. The CB WG noted the changes with no issues raised.

The recent publication of Draft Stability Programme Update Incorporating the Department of Finance's Spring Forecasts and its different migration scenarios and their implications for emissions were noted as relevant to this work.

3. Carbon Budgets Work Plan and Topics for Meetings

The Secretariat outlined the proposed workplan and schedule of topics which had been updated further to the discussions at the first meeting of the group.

- Idea of a workshop in September noted as useful – feedback suggested it would be useful to invite bodies involved in preparing macroeconomic projections (e.g., Central Bank, IFAC, ESRI, Dept. Finance) either to this workshop or to prior meetings to discuss the differences in their assumptions.
- The pace of growth of renewables relative to the growth in demand was highlighted as a key consideration in terms of macroeconomic assessment and an action was raised to flesh out macroeconomic drivers, as opposed to just focusing on macroeconomic impacts.
- The importance of early consideration of biodiversity constraints and implications for example of the spatial implications of land use change and development of renewables infrastructure was noted.
- There was discussion on how topics separate to modelling work will be addressed in each meeting, in terms of preparation of Secretariat papers and invited expert presentations/contributions.
- Feedback was provided on the topics to be considered and the detail of how aspects such as just transition, socioeconomics and macroeconomics and the land use review would be considered.
- An action was taken by the Secretariat to follow up on timelines for the Land Use Review and provide this to the CB WG.

The carbon budgets draft work plan was presented, including draft timelines for three iterations working back from the deadline in Q3 2024. It was noted that further requests under the MoU would issue with more precise details and timelines of capacity required following feedback from the WG on the draft timelines.

- Feedback was received from the CB WG on the plan, in terms of achievable timelines but ongoing capacity challenges were noted.

- Useful to have a helicopter framework of the intent for the programme and early sight of timelines.
- A challenge was noted concerning the ability of models to fully reflect the 2024 projections.
- It was noted that the national biodiversity action plan is due this year which may have implications for the carbon budgets.
- Questions on additional work on biodiversity assessment raised and how this fits into the model iterations. David Styles noted that some preliminary data may be available in this respect to feed into the process.
- It was noted that other risks could be raised by CB WG members for inclusion in the risk register.
- The importance of clear communication of technical changes was noted.
- It was suggested that how the working group would engage with each topic was unclear and the secretariat took an action to take on board the feedback from the WG in preparing inputs for each topic to be considered by the CB WG along with providing more detail in terms of how these topical discussions can inform the modelling.
- It was noted that the work schedule should be shared with relevant departments and agencies under the MoU.

4. Scoping of Modelling Work

- In terms of demographics and population projections, an update was provided on the planned timeline of CSO population projections, with a further update scheduled from the CSO at the September CB WG meeting. The importance of projections and implications in the energy sector, manufacturing and housing development was discussed.
- Scenario development – a recap was provided on the scenarios considered for CB1 and CB2 along with an overview of the current Irish modelling landscape. One of the early objectives for the CB WG will be to develop a process map focused on the carbon budgets, with the example of the EU Reference Scenario process map provided. Initial input was sought from the CB WG on the process/approach for sequencing of models.
- Perspectives on the role of the FAPRI model and Teagasc MACC were provided.
- In respect of the energy projections, additional scenarios may inform the process before final projections are available. A risk was raised that if there was a step change with 2023 emissions the provisional inventory of 2023 emissions would not be available in sufficient time for incorporation into the third iteration of modelling.
- It was noted that the three proposed iterations of modelling will provide a useful basis for loosely integrating parallel streams of modelling work, with commonality regarding assumptions providing the soft links between the models.

5. Learnings from the ESB Networks Dingle Project

Fergal Egan from ESNB provided a presentation to the CB WG on the Dingle Project;

- The project included testing of renewable technologies in people's homes, e.g. vehicle to grid chargers.
- Key findings from the study included the need for trusted sources of information, community engagement & capability, affordability of interventions.
- It was noted that a project in the Burren considered how successful community-based schemes might be in other localities.
- One particular challenge was the lack of baseline data at the start of the project and impact of covid restrictions, but there is some evidence of lasting impacts.

6. Next Steps and Agenda for next meeting

- Action to further develop the approach and preparation for topical discussions
- Action to provide an update on timelines for the Land Use Review
- Action to expand macroeconomic inputs discussions
- Next meeting will consider vision for 2050 and further discussion of modelling scenarios

7. AOB

- Noted that CB WG members can apply for reimbursement of travel expenses if necessary.

Actions Log

Action Number	Date Raised	Description	Owner	Due	Status
1	09/03/23	Secretariat to invite a speaker to provide an update on demographics and inform the group about the process for outputs from the 2022 Census.	CCAC Secretariat	Q2 2023	Closed – Update provided at CB WG Meeting 2 on 20/4/23 and CSO presentation scheduled for Meeting 6 on 8/9/23
2	09/03/23	Working Group members to provide written comment on the draft methodology and list of topics for consideration by 20/03/2023	CB WG Members	20/03/23	Closed – Comments received by 20/03/2023 and feedback discussed at CB WG Meeting 2
3	20/04/23	Expand discussion of macroeconomic inputs/ drivers	CCAC Secretariat and relevant CB WG Members	Q3 2023	Ongoing – Update to be provided at CB WG Meeting 4
4	20/04/23	Provide update on timelines for the Land Use Review	CCAC Secretariat	31/05/23	Update Provided at CB WG Meeting 3
5	20/04/23	Further develop the approach and preparation for topical discussions	CCAC Secretariat	Q2 2023	Ongoing – Secretariat to provide an update on the approach and preparation for upcoming topical discussions at each meeting.